



Research Consortium Archive

P(ISSN) : 3007-0031

E(ISSN) : 3007-004X

<https://rc-archive.com/index.php/Journal/about>



THE IMPACT OF LANGUAGE PLANNING AND POLICY ON BILINGUAL EDUCATION SYSTEM AND INDIGENOUS LANGUAGE MAINTENANCE IN GOVERNMENT SCHOOLS, BALUCHISTAN

Amjid Basham

PhD Scholar & Lecturer English Visiting Faculty. University of Gwadar

amjidhamza786@gmail.com

Abdul Majeed

Lecturer, Department of English, Federal Urdu University of Arts, Sciences and Technology, Karachi. abdul.majeed@fuuast.edu.pk

Hafiz Imran Nawaz*

Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Social sciences and Humanities, Department of English, Hamdard University, Karachi. Correspondence Author Email: Imran.nawaz@hamdard.edu.pk

Publisher : EDUCATION GENIUS SOLUTIONS

Review Type: Double Blind Peer Review

ABSTRACT

This study is aimed at exploring language planning and policy on bilingual education and maintaining the identity of indigenous language in Balochistan. The study focuses on the implementation language planning and policy as bilingual education system and within its domain to preserve the place of indigenous language. This study was pure qualitative to investigate the secondary school teachers responses over use of bilingualism and to maintain the credibility of indigenous language. The current study was conducted on five senior school teachers in Gwadar, Balochistan. The findings of this research reveal that government school teachers prefer their own mother tongue as compared to any other language. They believed their indigenous language more robust and trustworthy while teaching and using it as medium of instruction. Furthermore, English is considered the right language for communication but its application is less realized.

Keywords: Language Planning and Policy, Maintaining Indigenous Languages, Bilingualism

Introduction

Background of the Study

In accordance with (Wright, 2004) Language planning and policy (LLP) is based on the norm that practical communication of a community decides its linguistics choice. It is therefore regarded as the most challenging issue with language planning and policy is the disagreement between the want for the preservation of minority languages and its low demand in various sides of practical life. It has been reported that the local minority language users are confused to speak their mother language or to use the dominant language (Yudina, Melnichuk, and Seliverstova2020). Getting excess to the concept of language as a social capital is regarded as a valuable asset, affirming the competitive value of a dominant language, on the other hand, it is also necessary to focus on measures in order to preserve the minority languages (Jalil, Zaki and Irfan, 2020).

Significance of the Study

This study is very important that provides in-depth information about the teachers' belief over the use of bilingual education system. It highlights the importance of using and maintaining indigenous language when English is already in power as the medium of instruction. This study will come with fruitful results regarding the language planning and policy and the right use of language

Objective of the Study

The objectives of the present study are as followings:

- To find out the impact of language planning and policy on bilingual education system.
- To find out that how the maintenance of indigenous language is preserved in Government education sector in Balochistan.

Research Questions

The followings are the main research questions designed for the current study.

- What is the impact of language planning and policy on bilingual education system in Government schools in Balochistan?
- How the maintenance of indigenous language is preserved during the process of language planning and policy?

Literature Review

Language Planning and Policy in Pakistan

It is necessary that the government should decide for a careful language planning and policy in order to maintain a linguistic equilibrium between the federation and different ethnic users. There are two responsible constitutional bodies in Pakistan which formulate policies, the parliament and provincial body. Parliament with respect to (The constitution of Pakistan, 1973) plays an important role for the development of laws related to languages policies, Urdu which was made the national language by the parliament in order to bring unity among different ethnics groups belonging to various linguistics background (Bughio, 2014). It is also in the hands of provincial body as a policy making body to formulate language planning and policy at the level provincial level. According to (Roistika) any Provincial assembly in the country has the right to set down measures for the promotion of an indigenous language without diminishing the credibility of national language. For instance, the Sindh assembly has come forwarded to implement the Sindhi as indigenous language as a medium of instruction in education sector and promoting it for the purpose of teaching and learning at the various level (The LEP Sindh, 2006). On the other hand, Balochi as indigenous language has also been implemented at the various level of teaching by the Balochistan provincial. Desperately, the provincial assembly of Punjab has failed to work for the promotion and preservation of language planning and policies (Tariq Rahman, 2017). Punjabi and Siriaki are the two main languages functional in Panjab, but treated as socially stigmatized.

The case in Panjab province is quite dissimilar as the critics Tariq Rahman (2017); Rose and Conama (2018) argue that majority in Panjab province did not allow it to be functionalized. It has been researched that they have the power sharing relationship with the bureaucracy and army and the need of promoting any other language in the province is not expected or needed to be implemented at the provincial level. It is found out that Panjab have been striving to combine other language communities particularly the Siriaki (Ashraf, Turner, & Laar, 2021). Related to some critics Tariq Rahman (2006, 2007, 2017) consider on the point that despite being in power and benefited of various circumstances, there has not been any effective strategies by the Siriaki community for the promotion and preservation of their indigenous language in the province. They are not ready to promote and preserve their own language and even though they

feel of their marginalized status in the society and on political grounds.

As per earlier statements, it is quite clear that Pakistan is supposed to rethink carefully about language planning and policy in order to empower the growth of national, provincial and local languages of different linguistics groups. Pakistan got independence in 1947, during the early stages for the most of time the language planning and policy had continued due to British colonization. It is the need of time to rethink of formulation of language planning and policy of the pre-independence era and the planning and policy developed later on. The most significant document which was published in 1835 known as Macaulay Minutes. The recommendation of this document asserted the institutions to use English as supreme language. The main aim of this language policy was to create an Anglicized Indian nation that is what he gave the title of "black skin with the white mind" (1835). Oriental learning centers were abolished due this policy document. It resulted with fewer books published in Arabic, Persian and Sanskrit without any stipend being used on the study of such subjects. Despite the aggression from the Indian people, Macaulay succeeded to established English as a medium of instructions in schools throughout the India; this led the idea of promoting English in other parts of the region like (India, Pakistan and Bangladesh).

According to (Cole & Bruch, 2006) Provinces like Balochistan, Sindh and Khyber PakhtoonKha, the use of indigenous languages of these provinces are highly promoted and used widely. The provincial language of Sindh is Sindhi, which is belongs to the Indo-Aryan family of languages. Sindhi language is spoken throughout the Sindh in order to give importance to its identity and cultural heritage (Tariq Rahman, 2006). This language has its local speakers in Pakistan and some parts of India like Mumbai and Gujarat (Cole & Bruch, 2006). In accordance with (Shamim, 2008) moreover Urdu and English, it is also applied as a medium of instruction at the school and college levels and it has the majority of about 14.57% of the total population of the country (Bureau of Statistics, Pakistan, 2017).

Likewise, as per the report of (Bureau of Statistics, Pakistan, 2017) the provincial language of Balochistan is Balochi which has the 3.02% of the native population. In addition, this language is also spoken in some parts of Iran and Afghanistan. It represents to mark the ethnic and culture identity of the people of Balochistan. It is associated with the Baloch ethnic groups for their cultural identification in the province as well as in the country.

Historical Background of Bilingualism in Pakistan and its Education System

According to Christian & Genesee (2001) it is a type of education when two different languages are spoken in an education system. Pakistan is a country where different native languages are spoken, like Sindhi, Baloch, Pashto, Panjabi and Siriaki. Urdu was declared

as the national language right after the independence in 1947. It was the language of minority at the start. Urdu language was entitled as national language of Pakistan in order to strengthen and bring unity among provinces. It is claimed that every Pakistani is bilingual by acquiring their mother tongue at the first place and later Urdu as the national language. Despite of having extensive research in this area, still there is disagreement over the effectiveness of bilingual education system in Pakistan. Baker & Prys Jouns (1998) explain the stance of Bilingual-education proponents that cultural language varieties should be cultivated in order to strengthen the nationalism. In addition, Collier and Thomas (1999) come up the result that brilliant bilingual students build up stronger rational capabilities over monolingual students and that they usually act upon better than the monolingual students on school tests. According to Hakuta (1986) undoubtedly portrays that those who maintain developing their first languages have certain cognitive advantages over their English-only counterparts. Likewise, Cummins (2000b) identifies that "bilingualism is linked with enhanced linguistic, cognitive, and academic development when both languages are motivated to develop" (p. Xi). Crawford (1992) pinpoint that when their first language is polished alongside English, LEP students can normally grow their English fluency. He added that by entering the mainstream later, they can have improved chances of success and fluency in two languages.

Impact of language policies on indigenous languages of Pakistan

It is revealed through an examination of language planning and policy that Urdu as a national language has been promoted to take the place of indigenous languages in Pakistan (Tariq Rahman, 2007). As a consequence of this result, the speakers of different languages like, Panjabi, Sindhi, Siriaki, and Pashto are deprived to establish the credibility of their own languages. The result of this derivation has created an uprising among different indigenous language speakers to raise their voices for their linguistic rights. The ethnic resistance provoked to disfavor the use of Urdu and (T Rahman, 1997) and indignation rose among indigenous users other than Urdu speakers. It is believed by different ethnic groups that language is the symbol of their culture identity and existence (Tariq Rahman, 1995, 2006). Activists belonging to different ethnic groups endorse Urdu as a bridge of communication among different users but the access use of this by the allied class is disappointing (Rahman, 2011). In a nutshell, ethnic antagonism resulted due the patronization of Urdu language and it fortified the ethnicity and the prevalence of cultural diversity in the country.

The development of ethnolinguistics communities and the use their languages share their geographical backgrounds, cultural norms and different ancestral values. The empowerment of their indigenous languages will give them their due rights linked with their mother language. They came up with their demands in order

to be recognized as the possessors of different economic, political and linguistics rights. According to the framework of Fishman (2001) it is believed that such ethnic speech or ethnolinguistics communities qualify for their own identification. In Pakistan, the indigenous language speakers qualify to be entitled as ethnolinguistics communities in order to use their mother tongues for the achieving the goal of their life and basic rights.

Research Methodology

The research for this study is based on descriptive qualitative analysis in order to find out the impact of language planning and policy in education sector and how indigenous language maintenance is preserved. The objective of the qualitative study is to understand the individual and group related phenomena towards the problems of human in society (Creswell, 2008p.32). There were total five participants who selected were selected from a Government school through purposive sampling technique. The data was collected through semi-structured interview with open ended questions. Thematic analysis process was carried out to analyze the data of the participants. Thematic analysis is a qualitative data analysis method. Thematic analysis gives an opportunity to make new themes out of the rich data from the interviews. Thematic analysis method is used for discourse extraction from the received data because it helps to create new themes and pattern from the data in order to capture the research topic being investigated (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

Findings And Discussion

Language planning and policy plays an important role for the construction of better education policy within the country. It helps to determine the basic quality of education at provincial level. Pakistan is a multilingual based country where different ethnolinguistics group are living and involved in various educational platforms. The findings of the recent study reveal the impact of language planning and policy on Bilingual Education system and Indigenous Language Maintenance in a Government School Balochistan. The results of the current study are based on the following themes for further discussion.

Theme1. Importance of Indigenous Language

Pakistan is an ethnolinguistics based country where too many indigenous languages are spoken at the various levels. Indigenous languages play a significant while delivering educational lectures or classroom activities. It is believed by the teachers that Balochistan is a province which is very backward in field of education. Owing to which it believed by the teachers and as well as student to communicate with their mother tongue during teaching and learning process.

“Our mother language is very helpful while teaching the students in school because it helps us to deliver the information and text clearly” (T-2). “It is very important to promote the indigenous language in school because educational background is student is very week and

they find it easy to understand and reply” (T-1). As per the teachers experiences, mother language becomes very important while teaching student and making them able to understand the text. It is convenient for the most of the teachers to interact with the students in their own language for a better understanding. It is reported by the teachers that student with low educational background suffer linguistics barriers if they are interacted with another language. Gwadar is a city of Balochistan which is regarded as the gate of central Asia. It is the city which is expected in future as an international business hub. During the research, when teachers were asked about the importance of English as international language, they came out with some positive responses about the significance of the English language. The main point that creates a bridge between the uses of indigenous languages and English as the right language, basically, teachers are not well trained to equip the students with the language commands. Teachers are interested to continue with some changes with regard to their old fashion way of adopting the indigenous. Mother can help the teachers and students to communicate with each other in order to create a better teaching and learning environment in school.

The results of the research show that the teachers at government level are very positive to use their own mother language while teaching students. It has been reported by the participants that English as an international language is very important to use in order to communicate with the students.

Theme.2 English as an International Language

It is believed by the teachers that English is an international language and it helps the students work in a more dynamic society. English plays an important role for the establishment of individual's identity in this technological world. Majority of the teachers endorsed the place that English has captured as the language of power, will definitely benefit the new generation towards a prosperous lifestyle. One the other hand, one of the teachers came with our with some different answers that most of the students have better English knowledge and experiences because they learn English from different English language centers and communicate better than us, as per the statement below.

“There are so many students with good communication skills and know how to speak English” (T-1). “Students come with different educational backgrounds; some of them are well in English because they joined the English institution at the early age” (T-5). As per the statement of teachers above, it is obvious that teachers are accepting their point of weaknesses and believe that students with robust communication skills can affect the teachers' attitudes while teaching the students. it has also been brought out that teachers were not fluent in English and their communication skills were very weak. Teachers mostly follow old tradition strategy while searching students. Grammar translation method is very common is

government schools while teaching students English subject, even though some of the teachers are not able to speak in English and face language barriers. English as the language of the world and medium of instruction by HEC is considered a perfect language for national and international communication.

Theme3. Merits of Bilingual Education

Bilingualism is a process of sharing or referring anything using two different languages. It is a medium of communication that is used to use two different languages. Bilingualism refers to the use of two languages. It can be either indigenous or Urdu as national language. This has reported as an important theme by the teachers that they feel quite satisfied while interacting through bilingualism. It shows that the teachers are more comfortable while switching from one language to another. Teachers were very found very traditional lover that make them compelled to use their own mother language while teaching. It is very common in Government schools that even if any teacher knows how to speak English but does not like to or system does not allow him or her to resort to that particular language.

"We are not that competent to use English or language while teaching because we feel comfortable while using our own mother tongue" (T-3).

"Government teachers mostly like teaching any subject with involvement of mother language because students also like this to understand" (T-3).

The advantages of bilingualism can be realized by the statement of the teachers above and it is therefore said that teachers and students find themselves comfortable communicating with their mother tongue, because it helps them to understand the text better than any other language's use.

"Some of our teachers also like to talk in Urdu language while teaching and for other purposes but the percentage is quite less" (T-1).

"Urdu as national language is preferred more than English during the process of instruction" (T-4).

It can be concluded by these statements that Urdu is preferred more than English language for the purpose of communication, because this language is very common in Pakistan or is the language of public.

Conclusion

It is concluded that language planning and policy has an effective impact on teachers during the process of teaching and learning at the school level. It is therefore said that language planning and policy has not produced productive results. It has turned out by responses of the Government teachers that they are more inclined to use their mother tongue while teaching at school level. It can be concluded that the impact language planning and policy does not favor to preserve the quality of indigenous languages but rather promotes to use those languages which may not be supported or

favored by the Government school teachers. Urdu as medium of instruction and national language of state is considered more favorable by teachers and like to use this language in schools. Indigenous languages play a significant while delivering educational lectures or classroom activities. It is believed by the teachers that Balochistan is a province which is very backward in field of education. Owing to which it believed by the teachers and as well as student to communicate with their mother tongue during teaching and learning process.

References

- Abbas, A., & Shehzad, W. (2018). Prospects of Mother Tongue as Medium of Education in Pakistan. *ARIEL-An International Research Journal of English Language and Literature*, 28, 17- 29.
- Abbas, Jalil, Zaki & Irfan (2020). Implicit Measure of Language Attitude: Study of Punjabi Native Speakers by Using Matched Guise Technique. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 13 (1), 194-206
- Adeney, K. (2016). Federalism and ethnic conflict regulation in India and Pakistan, 44-52. : Springer
- Agheyisi, R., & Fishman, J. A. (1970). Language attitude studies: A brief survey of methodological approaches. *Anthropological linguistics*, 137-157.
- Ahmad, A., & Khan, A. (2017). Provincial Autonomy and Devolution of Language Policy in Pakistan: Retrospect and Prospect. *Pakistan Journal of social Sciences (PJSS)*, 37(1).
- Ashraf, M. A., Turner, D. A., & Laar, R. A. (2021). Multilingual language practices in education in Pakistan: The conflict between policy and practice. *SAGE Open*, 11(1), 21582440211004140.
 doi:<https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440211004140>
- BalDauf Jr, R. B. (2006). Rearticulating the case for micro language planning in a language ecology context. *Current issues in language planning*, 7(2-3), 147-170.
 doi:<https://doi.org/10.2167/cilp092.0>
- Bamgbose, A. (1989). Issues for a model of language planning. *Language problems and language planning*, 13(1), 24-34.
 doi:<https://doi.org/10.1075/lplp.13.1.03bam>
- Barkhuizen, G., & Knoch, U. (2006). Macro-level policy and micro-level planning: Afrikaans speaking immigrants in New Zealand. *Australian Review of Applied Linguistics*, 29(1), 3- 1.
 doi:<https://doi.org/10.2104/aral0603>
- Bughio, M. Q. (2014). Determining the status and use of languages spoken in Pakistan. *Darnioji daugiakalbystė* (4), 46-56.
 doi:<https://doi.org/10.7220/2335-2027.4.3>
- Cole, M. S., & Bruch, H. (2006). Organizational identity strength, identification, and commitment and their relationships to turnover intention: Does organizational hierarchy matter? *Journal of Organizational Behavior: The International Journal of Industrial, Occupational and Organizational Psychology and*

- Behavior, 27(5), 585-605. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1002/job.378>
- Fishman, J. A. (2001). Can threatened languages be saved?: Reversing language shift, revisited: A 21st century perspective (Vol. 116). Multilingual Matters.
- García, O., & Menken, K. (2015). Cultivating an ecology of multilingualism in schools. Challenges for language education and policy: Making space for people, 95-108. Gulzar, M. A., & Qadir, S. A. (2010). Issues of Language (s) Choice and Use: A Pakistani Perspective. Pakistan Journal of social Sciences (PJSS), 30(2).